JoSSEd

Research Paper

Application of Project Based Learning with Scientific Article Analysis Method to Improve Student Learning Outcomes in Education Profession Courses

Hikmawati¹*

¹Physics Education Study Program, University of Mataram, Mataram, Indonesia.

DOI: https://doi.org/10.29303/jossed.v3i2.2452

Article Info

Received: August 25, 2022 Revised: September 28, 2022 Accepted: October 25, 2022 Published: October 31, 2022 **Abstract:** The Education Profession course is a course that equips students so that one day they can carry out the main tasks of professional teachers, namely educating, teaching, guiding, directing, training, assessing, and evaluating students. The purpose of this research is to improve student learning outcomes in the Professional Education course through the application of Project Based Learning (PjBL) using the scientific article analysis method. This research was conducted in 6 meetings starting from March 2 2022 to April 6 2022. The subjects of this research included 22 students who attended the Education Profession course in Class II-C, in the Physics Education Study Program, University of Mataram. The research instrument for obtaining data on student learning outcomes uses essay tests given at the beginning of the meeting and at the end of the meeting. The increase in the score of learning outcomes after treatment in the form of implementing PjBL with the scientific article analysis method is calculated by the N-gain test. The results showed that the pre-test score was 51.2, while the post-test score was 80.3. Therefore, the N-gain value is 60.4 which is in the medium category. Thus, the implementation of PjBL using the scientific article analysis method has improved student learning outcomes in the Education Professions course.

Keywords: Project Based Learning; Article analysis; Student learning

Citation: Hikmawati, H. (2022). Application of Project Based Learning with Scientific Article Analysis Method to Improve Student Learning Outcomes in Education Profession Courses. Journal of Science and Science Education, 3(2), 115–121. https://doi.org/10.29303/jossed.v3i2.2452

INTRODUCTION

Learning model innovations in terms of planning, implementing and evaluating learning need to be continuously carried out to improve student learning outcomes, especially HOTS. HOTS-based learning and assessment has an influence on improving the quality of education so that the quality of human resources can also increase (Suhendro et al., 2021). Innovative learning models such as Project Based Learning (PjBL) support learning objectives that expect students to master various soft skills competencies to face the challenges of the 21st century, namely 4C skills (Communication, Collaboration, Critical thinking and Problem Solving, and Creativity and Innovation). The learning process to produce a product in the PjBL model trains students to carry out broader inquiries so students can answer questions, solve problems, and complete complex challenges (Asman et al., 2022). The application of the 4C competency-based innovative learning model has a significant influence on improving student learning outcomes at universities. The intended learning outcomes include cognitive, affective, and psychomotor aspects (Supena et al., 2021).

Research on 4C competency development-based learning is becoming an interesting topic, especially in the Bali and Nusa Tenggara regions (Hidayatullah et al., 2021). The results of research on 4C-based innovative learning models such as the application of the Project Based Learning model in learning can improve student learning outcomes, including students' ability to think creatively (Susanto et al., 2022).

* Corresponding Author: hikmawati@unram.ac.id



Journal of Science and Science Education

The PjBL model can not only improve creative thinking skills, but also learning outcomes in the form of problem-solving skills. This PjBL learning model can continue to be developed in a synergistic and sustainable manner (Rochim et al., 2022). Therefore, research and training on 4C competency-based innovative learning models really need to be done. In addition, 4C competency-based activities need to be improved both in quantity and quality. An important factor that can make efforts to improve 4C competencies successful is the policy of the local government related to the education system (Ağaoğlu & Demir, 2020). In addition, things that influence the development of 4C competencies are cultural factors. The culture of the surrounding environment has an impact on the level of 4C competence possessed by students. In other words, lifestyle patterns owned by rural and urban communities greatly affect students' collaboration skills during the learning process. Some habits such as greeting, mutual cooperation, and getting to know each other are more entrenched in rural communities (Khoiri et al., 2021).

The PjBL model can not only be applied at the elementary level, but at all levels of education. However, the implementation of the PjBL model in the classroom must pay attention to various factors, including facilities and infrastructure, characteristics of learning materials, as well as characteristics of students (Keleman et al., 2021). In fact, the application of the PjBL model at the PAUD level has a positive effect on the development of artistic skills for teachers and students (Ibrahim et al., 2022). The application of the PjBL model at the high school level can improve learning outcomes such as developing student character values and science process skills (Sejati et al., 2021). The application of the PjBL model at the university level is an alternative that can be used to facilitate students in developing critical thinking skills as part of learning outcomes that are very much needed in the 21st century. Students are also more active in the lecture process with the PjBL model compared to the conventional model (Budiman et al., 2021). Student creativity in the experimental class is better than the control class use the conventional model (Ridlo et al., 2020).

Each stage in the PjBL model can facilitate the development of critical thinking skills and communication and collaboration skills. Therefore, the implementation of PjBL can improve cognitive learning outcomes, critical thinking skills, and students' social attitudes (Launuru et al., 2021). The application of the PjBL model can also improve student learning outcomes, namely time management skills (Santoso et al., 2021). The application of the PjBL model in learning not only improves student learning outcomes but also improve various teacher skills (Paristiowati et al., 2022). Student response to the application of the PjBL model in lectures was very good. The PjBL model can be recommended for lectures to increase student motivation and interest in lectures (Handayani et al., 2021).

Teachers must prepare various learning tools if they want to apply the PjBL model. The intended learning devices are: syllabus, learning implementation plans, teaching materials, student worksheets, learning media, and assessment instruments (Triana et al., 2020). The application of the PjBL model can be more optimal in improving student learning outcomes if in the learning process the teacher integrates various things that are close to everyday life. Contextual phenomena will provide meaningful learning experiences for students. The PjBL model with an ethno-science context is an innovation that can be recommended to improve student learning outcomes in all aspects, namely cognitive, affective and psychomotor (Sumarni & Kadarwati, 2020). The application of the PjBL model with the method of analyzing scientific articles, including articles that discuss ethnoscience and other forms of local wisdom is worthy of development. This study aims to improve student learning outcomes in the Professional Education course through the application of Project Based Learning (PjBL) using the scientific article analysis method.

METHOD

The research aimed at improving student learning outcomes was conducted in 6 meetings. Treatment in the form of Project Based Learning (PjBL) with scientific article analysis methods is carried out online through the Mataram University Online Learning System which can be accessed via the link: https://daring.unram.ac.id/

Details of research activities through the SPADA University of Mataram mentioned above starting on March 2 2022 to April 6 2022 are shown in Table 1.

Meeting	Date	Торіс	Activity
First	March 2, 2022	Teacher Competency	Analysis of scientific articles that discuss the topic of:
Second	March, 9 2022		Deepening the material by submitting questions according to the topic, namely: "Teacher
Third	March, 16 2022	General Policy in Teacher Training and Development	Competence". Analysis of scientific articles that discuss the topic of: "General Policy in Teacher Development and Development".
Fourth	March, 23 2022		Development. Deepening the material through submitting questions according to the topic namely: "General Policy in
Fifth	March, 30 2022	Teacher Competency Improvement	Analysis of scientific articles that discuss the topic of: "Increasing Teacher Competence".
Sixth	April 6, 2022		Deepening the material through submitting questions according to the topic, namely: "Increasing Teacher Competence".

Table 1. Details of research activities

The product produced in the implementation of this PjBL is in the form of the results of the analysis of scientific articles in accordance with the topics discussed. The steps taken in implementing PjBL using the scientific article analysis method in this study include: 1) determine fundamental questions; 2) designing project planning; 3) to arrange the schedule; 4) monitoring students and their project progress; 5) test the results; 6) evaluate the experience (Winangun, 2021). Lecture coordination includes the mentoring process so as to produce products in this study using the WA Group application assistance.

The subjects of this study consisted of 22 students who attended the Education Profession course in Class II-C, in the Physics Education Study Program, University of Mataram. This research was conducted in the even semester, 2021/2022 academic year. The research instrument used to obtain data on student learning outcomes is an essay test. The test is given to students at the beginning of the meeting and at the end of the meeting. The increase in student learning outcomes scores after treatment in the form of implementing PjBL with the scientific article analysis method is calculated using the N-gain test. The increase in student learning outcomes from the pretest to the final test is calculated using the N-gain with the following equation (Hake, 1999).

$$N - gain = \frac{S_{post} - S_{pre}}{S_{max} - S_{pre}} x100\%$$
(1)

The N-gain acquisition category is shown in Table 2.

Table 2. Category of N-	gain acquisition
Interval (%)	Category
g > 70	High
$30 \le g \le 70$	Medium
g < 30	Low

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The online lecture system for the Education Profession course in this study is based on the Learning Management System (LMS) through the SPADA University of Mataram. The Online Learning System in question can be seen in Figure 1. Lecturers provide files of learning materials which become initial knowledge or information for students. After the allotted time allocated for studying the material files has been exhausted, the lecturer gives instructions for conducting discussions through the "Discussion Forum" feature. Lecture coordination is carried out through the subject WA Group. Students discuss with discussion partners that have been formed by the lecturer. Material for discussion comes from the results of the analysis of scientific articles related to certain topics according to the learning material at the meeting at that time.

E SPASA Mate	akuliah = Panduan = Link Terkait = Login 🗘 📌 🧶
i≡ course sections <	PERTEMUAN TANGGAL 2 MARET 2022
& Participants	
& Badges	Materi bab 2 Kompetensi Guru
☆ Competencies	Mark as done
III Grades	silahkan unduh Materi bab 2 Kompetensi Guru berdasarkan UU
(?) Dashboard	Corum Diskusi Mark as done
ति Site home	PETUNJUK: Pelajari Pasal 10 yang membahas kompetensi guru pada UNDANG-UNDANG REPUBLIK INDONESIA NOMOR 14 TAHUN 2005
苗 Calendar	Ten Tang Guru Dan Dosen. Carilah artikel yang membahas tentang: Kompetensi guru sebagaimana dimaksud dalam Pasal 8 meliputi kompetensi
영 My courses 〈	pedagogik, kompetensi kepribadian, kompetensi sosial, dan kompetensi profesional yang diperoleh melalui pendidikan profesi.
Private files	Buatlah analisis tentang empat kompetensi guru tersebut berdasarkan artikel ilmiah yang telah diunduh! Ingat untuk mencantumkan referensi artikel yang dianalisis!
🛱 Content bank	Hasil analisis didiskusikan bersama dengan pasangan diskusil
	🔁 Daftar pasangan diskusi
	Mark as done
	Silahkan unduh Daftar pasangan diskusi berikut.
① Accessibility settings	

Figure 1. Instructions for analyzing scientific articles

The process of student discussion with discussion partners according to the groups formed by the lecturer can be seen in Figure 2. Each student conducts an analysis of scientific articles, while the discussion partners will provide comments in the form of responses or questions related to the results of scientific article analysis. Interactive discussions took place between discussion pairs, as well as the course supervisor lecturers. Lecturers also provide responses that are deemed necessary to increase student understanding of the topic of discussion.

SPASA Matal	ullah - Panduan - Link Terkait - Login 🗘 🔗 🌔
CHITE CONTROL OF THE	Di apolicio dari. Jumet Bendidikan Universitas Can it Borikut dibawah referenzi artikat :
≡ Course sections <	Drahansis dan samar Pendakan universitas Garac benkat abawan referensi araker.
	https://journal.uniga.ac.id/index.php/JP/article/download/16/16
B Participants	
🔉 Badges	Permetink Edit Delete Penly
	гонтыпк сак роксе кору
Competencies	
	by U - Wednesday, 2 March 2022, 6:03 PM
🗉 Grades	
	jelaskan cerminan pribadi yang harus dimiliki seorang guru/dosen untuk meningkatkan kompetensi kepribadiannya seperti yang anda
Dashboard	jelaskan dan bagaimana pengaruh besar karakteristik kepribadian seorang guru dan dosen sebagai tenaga pendidik yang tugas
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	utamanya mengajar?
a) site home	Permalink Show parent Edit Split Delete Reply
Calendar	Re: T
	by Iz ir - Wednesday, 2 March 2022, 6:24 PM
Bt My courses <	4
	Seperti yang saya jelaskan diatas, Pribadi guru memiliki andil yang sangat besar terhadap keberhasilan pendidikan, khususnya
Privato filos	dalam kegiatan pembelajaran. Pribadi guru sangat berperan dalam membentuk pribadi peserta didik. Ada indikator yang
211104(01100	mencerminkan kepribadian positit seorang guru yaitu:
Contant bank	= super. = super
_ content bank	- Disjolin.
	- Jujur.
	- Rendah hati.
	- Berwibawa.
	- Santun.
	- Empati.
	- IKRIGS. Bergihlek mulia
Concessionly settings	= Bertinder see un norma sosial & bukum dill

Figure 2. The process of discussing the results of the analysis of scientific articles

Treatment in the form of applying the Project Based Learning model with the scientific article analysis method has succeeded in increasing student learning outcomes in the Education Profession course. The results showed that the average score of students during the pre-test was 51.2. After treatment, student learning outcomes increased, this can be seen from the average score at the time of the post-test which increased to 80.3. Student learning outcomes during the pre-test and post-test can be seen in Figure 3.



Figure 3. Student Learning Outcomes

Journal of Science and Science Education

Based on the pre-test and post-test values, the N-gain value can be determined. From the calculation, the N-gain value is 60.4 which is in the medium category. This means that the implementation of PjBL using the scientific article analysis method has improved student learning outcomes in the Education Profession course. This Education Profession course is a course that equips students so that one day they can carry out the main tasks of professional teachers, namely educating, teaching, guiding, directing, training, assessing, and evaluating students. The N-gain value for each student can be seen in Figure 4.



Figure 4. N-gain

During the COVID-19 pandemic, learning system innovation was needed in implementing the PjBL model to support government policies regarding restrictions on social interaction or direct interaction between teachers and students in class. Learning systems that utilize technology can be the best choice in the form of online learning, or it can be a combination of online and face-to-face learning (Hujjatusnaini et al., 2022). The application of the PjBL model both offline and online has a positive effect on improving student learning outcomes, if there is good two-way communication between teachers and students (Kim, 2021).

Online learning during the COVID-19 pandemic has various advantages compared to conventional learning. In conventional learning, teaching materials that have been delivered by the teacher cannot be repeated, while notes that can be made by students are still limited. The teacher's explanation in conventional learning also has limitations in transferring knowledge to students. Conventional learning also has limited space and learning time because it cannot be accessed anytime and anywhere, even though currently students have a tendency and dependency on digital or ICT-based content. This situation is a positive value for online learning where teaching materials can be accessed, stored, or shared via the internet network (Rabiman et al., 2020).

The use of online learning through the LMS (Learning Management System) can support the ability to write and perform analysis (Duin & Tham, 2020). Lectures that use scientific-based LMS in SPADA (Network Learning System) have proven effective in improving student learning outcomes (Saputro & Susilowati, 2019). Kendala yang dapat terjadi ketika perkuliahan dilaksanakan secara daring adalah keterbatasan jaringan internet, technological limitations, and limitations in the use of applications (El Khuluqo et al., 2021).

For science learning that requires practical or experimental activities, teachers can use virtual laboratories to help students understand concepts through various scientific activities (Aldiab et al., 2019). Therefore, prospective teacher students need to familiarize themselves with online learning as a preparation for teaching in real class later. This online learning can be modified with various innovative learning models, including the Project Based Learning model. Curriculum design using the PjBL model requires good evaluation instruments so that it can have an impact on improving the quality and quality of education (Subando et al., 2021).

The personality possessed by a teacher can become a hidden curriculum. This personality influences the way teachers teach and educate students. The teacher's personality is related to the effectiveness of strengthening student character education at school. The personality in question includes: 1) the teacher is able to be a role model; 2) the teacher is able to act as a friend; 3) the teacher gives an example of discipline; 4) the teacher masters the subject matter; 5) teachers are fair; 6) teachers can respect students; 7) the teacher is patient; 8) teachers want to learn for life; 9) the teacher is relaxed; 10) teachers are

considered fun by students; 11) the teacher is not fierce; 12) teachers master skills in educating student character (Lukman et al., 2021).

CONCLUSION

Treatment in the form of applying the Project Based Learning (PjBL) model using the scientific article analysis method has improved student learning outcomes in the Education Profession course. The knowledge gained by students is a provision to become a professional teacher. Materials that have been mastered by students through the application of the PjBL model using the scientific article analysis method are: first, Teacher Competence; second, General Policy in Teacher Training and Development; third, Teacher Competency Improvement. The ability to analyze scientific articles based on discussion topics in the implementation of the PjBL model in Education Profession lectures is an effort to improve the 4C competencies that students must have in the 21st century. The PjBL model with the scientific article analysis method can also be used in other subjects, depending on the characteristics of the material and the characteristics student. Further research needs to be conducted to see and analyze the effect of the PjBL model using the scientific article analysis method on strengthening character education at universities, as well as its influence on various soft skills needed by students in solving problems and in the world of work in the future.

REFERENCES

- Ağaoğlu, O., & Demir, M. (2020). The integration of 21 st century skills into education: an evaluation based on an activity example. Journal of Gifted Education and Creativity, 7(3), 105–114.
- Aldiab, A., Chowdhury, H., Kootsookos, A., Alam, F., & Allhibi, H. (2019). Utilization of Learning Management Systems (LMSs) in higher education system: A case review for Saudi Arabia. *Energy Procedia*, 160(2018), 731–737. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.egypro.2019.02.186
- Asman, Kumaro, M., & Barliana, M. S. (2022). Integration of 4Cs Skills into Learning by Using the Project Based Learning (PjBL) Model to Face the Challenges of the 21st Century. Proceedings of the 4th International Conference on Innovation in Engineering and Vocational Education (ICIEVE 2021), 651 (Icieve 2021), 88–93. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.220305.018
- Budiman, D. A., Hamzah, S., Sarwono, S., & Yulistio, D. (2021). Improving Students' Critical Thinking Skills by Using Project-Based Learning (PBL). Proceeding of 1 St UPP & Corolla International Conference Bengkulu, 2014, 1–10.
- Duin, A. H., & Tham, J. (2020). The Current State of Analytics: Implications for Learning Management System (LMS) Use in Writing Pedagogy. Computers and Composition, 55, 102544. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compcom.2020.102544
- El Khuluqo, I., Ghani, A. R. A., & Fatayan, A. (2021). Postgraduate students' perspective on supporting "learning from home" to solve the covid-19 pandemic. International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education, 10(2), 615–623. https://doi.org/10.11591/ijere.v10i2.21240
- Hake, R. R. (1999). Analyzing Change/Gain Scores. In Indiana University (pp. 1–4). Indiana University. https://doi.org/10.24036/ekj.v1.i1.a10
- Handayani, D., Winarni, E. W., Sundaryono, A., & Firdaus, M. L. (2021). Implementation of Project-Based Learning Model with Edmodo Application in the Capita Selecta Chemistry Course. *IJORER*: International Journal of Recent Educational Research, 2(2), 184–195. https://doi.org/10.46245/ijorer.v2i2.90
- Hidayatullah, Z., Wilujeng, I., Nurhasanah, N., Gusemanto, T. G., & Makhrus, M. (2021). Synthesis of the 21st Century Skills (4C) Based Physics Education Research In Indonesia. JIPF (Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Fisika), 6(1), 88. https://doi.org/10.26737/jipf.v6i1.1889
- Hujjatusnaini, N., Corebima, A. D., Prawiro, S. R., & Gofur, A. (2022). the Effect of Blended Project-Based Learning Integrated With 21St-Century Skills on Pre-Service Biology Teachers' Higher-Order Thinking Skills. Jurnal Pendidikan IPA Indonesia, 11(1), 104–118. https://doi.org/10.15294/jpii.v11i1.27148
- Ibrahim, A., Elfeky, M., Alharbi, S. M., Abdul, E. S., & Ahmed, H. (2022). The Effect Of Project-Based Learning In Enhancing Creativity And Skills Of Arts Among Kindergarten Student Teachers. Journal of Positive School Psychology, 6(8), 2182–2191.
- Keleman, M., Rasul, M. S., & Jalaludin, N. A. (2021). Assessment of Higher Order Thinking Skills Through Stem Integration Project-Based Learning for Elementary Level. International Journal of Social Science and Human Research, 04(04), 835–846. https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v4-i4-40
- Khoiri, A., Evalina, Komariah, N., Utami, R. T., Paramarta, V., Siswandi, Janudin, & Sunarsi, D. (2021). 4Cs Analysis of 21st Century Skills-Based School Areas. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 1764(1). https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1764/1/012142
- Kim, Y. (2021). The Problem/Project-Based Learning (PBL/PjBL) at Online Classes. International Journal of Advanced Culture Technology, 9(1), 162–167. https://doi.org/10.17703/IJACT.2021.9.1.162
- Launuru, A., Rumahlatu, D., & Matdoan, M. N. (2021). PjBL-HOTS learning model: Its application and effect on cognitive learning outcomes, critical thinking, and social attitudes. *BIOEDUPAT: Pattimura Journal of Biology and Learning*, 1(1), 1–10. https://doi.org/10.30598/bioedupat.v1.i1.pp1-10
- Lukman, Marsigit, Istiyono, E., Kartowagiran, B., Retnawati, H., Kistoro, H. C. A., & Putranta, H. (2021). Effective teachers' personality in strengthening character education. International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education,

Journal of Science and Science Education

10(2), 512-521. https://doi.org/10.11591/ijere.v10i2.21629

- Paristiowati, M., Rahmawati, Y., Fitriani, E., Satrio, J. A., & Hasibuan, N. A. P. (2022). Developing Preservice Chemistry Teachers' Engagement with Sustainability Education through an Online, Project-Based Learning Summer Course Program. Sustainability (Switzerland), 14(3). https://doi.org/10.3390/su14031783
- Rabiman, R., Nurtanto, M., & Kholifah, N. (2020). Design and development E-learning system by learning management system (Lms) in vocational education. International Journal of Scientific and Technology Research, 9(1), 1059–1063.
- Ridlo, Z. R., Nuha, U., Terra, I. W. A., & Afafa, L. (2020). The implementation of project-based learning in STEM activity (water filtration system) in improving creative thinking skill. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series, 1563*(1). https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1563/1/012073
- Rochim, R. A., Prabowo, P., Budiyanto, M., Hariyono, E., & Prahani, B. K. (2022). The Use of STEM-Integrated Projectbased Learning Models to Improve Learning Outcomes of Junior High School Students. Proceedings of the Eighth Southeast Asia Design Research (SEA-DR) & the Second Science, Technology, Education, Arts, Culture, and Humanity (STEACH) International Conference (SEADR-STEACH 2021), 627, 211–218. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.211229.034
- Santoso, A. M., Primandiri, P. R., Zubaidah, S., & Amin, M. (2021). The development of students' worksheets using project based learning (PjBL) in improving higher order thinking skills (HOTs) and time management skills of students. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 1806(1). https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1806/1/012173
- Saputro, B., & Susilowati, A. T. (2019). Effectiveness of Learning Management System (LMS) on In-Network Learning System (SPADA) based on scientific. Journal for the Education of Gifted Young Scientists, 7(3), 481–498. https://doi.org/10.17478/jegys.606029
- Sejati, D. J. W., Isnaeni, W., & Saptono, S. (2021). Analysis of High Level Thinking Skills, Character and Skills of Science Process of High School Students in Project Based Learning. *Journal of Innovative Science Education*, 10(2), 183– 192. http://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/jise
- Subando, J., Kartowagiran, B., & Munadi, S. (2021). Development of curriculum design evaluation instruments in strengthening Al-Irsyad ideology in Indonesia. International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education, 10(4), 1426–1435. https://doi.org/10.11591/IJERE.V10I4.21758
- Suhendro, Sugandi, D., & Ruhimat, M. (2021). The Urgency of HOTS-Oriented Learning and Assessment Towards Quality of Education in Facing Indonesia Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) 2030. Proceedings of the 5th Asian Education Symposium 2020 (AES 2020), 566(Aes 2020), 237–250. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210715.052
- Sumarni, W., & Kadarwati, S. (2020). Ethno-stem project-based learning: Its impact to critical and creative thinking skills. Jurnal Pendidikan IPA Indonesia, 9(1), 11–21. https://doi.org/10.15294/jpii.v9i1.21754
- Supena, I., Darmuki, A., & Hariyadi, A. (2021). The influence of 4C (constructive, critical, creativity, collaborative) learning model on students' learning outcomes. International Journal of Instruction, 14(3), 873–892. https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2021.14351a
- Susanto, S., Desrani, A., Ritonga, A. W., & Rubiyantoro, Y. (2022). Improving Students' Creative Thinking In Learning Arabic Through HOTS Based Project Based Learning Model. *An Nabighoh*, 24(1), 1. https://doi.org/10.32332/an-nabighoh.v24i1.3924
- Triana, D., Anggraito, Y. U., & Ridlo, S. (2020). Effectiveness of Environmental Change Learning Tools Based on STEM-PjBL Towards 4C Skills of Students. JISE, 9(2), 181–187. http://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/jise
- Winangun, I. M. A. (2021). Project Based Learning: Strategi Pelaksanaan Praktikum IPA SD Dimasa Pandemi Covid-19.Edukasi:JurnalPendidikanDasar,2(1),11–20.http://stahnmpukuturan.ac.id/jurnal/index.php/edukasi/article/view/1388